

CITY OF WARREN  
PLANNING COMMISSION  
PUBLIC HEARING

Regular Meeting held on December 4<sup>th</sup>, 2023, at 7:00 p.m.,

A Regular Meeting of the Warren Planning Commission was called for Monday, December 4<sup>th</sup>, 2023, at 7:00 p.m., in the Warren Community Center Auditorium, 5460 Arden, Warren, Michigan 48092.

Commissioners Present:

Sultana Chowdhury, Assistant Secretary  
Claudette Robinson  
Michelle Tutt  
Delwar Ansar  
Mahmuda Mouri, Secretary  
Merle Boniecki, Vice Chair  
Warren Smith, Chair

Also present:

Ron Wuerth – Planning Director  
Michelle Katopodes – Planner III  
David Crabtree – Assistant Planner  
Susan Heydel – Administrative Clerk  
Mary Michaels - Assistant City Attorney  
Patrick Conlin - Communications Department

1. CALL TO ORDER:  
Chair Smith - Calls the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:
3. ROLL CALL:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Tutt to excuse Commissioner Kupiec, supported by Commissioner Robinson. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

4. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Vice Chair Boniecki to approve, supported by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES NOVEMBER 20<sup>TH</sup>, 2023:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Robinson to approve, supported by Commissioner Tutt. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

Chair Smith – We have two new Ex-Officio’s Councilman Henry Newnan and Melody Magee, are you here this evening?

Secretary Mouri – No.

6. PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS:

Members of the audience who wish to address the Planning Commission this evening for a public hearing item may do so by first checking in with the court reporter at the right of the stage and will have three (3) minutes to speak.

REQUEST FOR REZONING WITH CONDITIONS: Located on the east side of Schoenherr Road; approximately 841.58 ft. north of Ten Mile Road; from the present zoning classification R-1-C, One Family Residential District to R-3, Multifamily Dwelling District; 25480, 25468, 25440 Schoenherr Road; Section 24; Rafi Ahmad.

**Postponed from November 20<sup>th</sup>, 2023.**

PETITIONERS PORTION:

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – Good evening, I am the Project Architect and I’m representing the gentleman here, Mr. Rafi Ahmad. We are talking about trying to get this property rezoned. It’s a triangle shape, it’s kind of irregular. We’ve been working very closely with the Planning Department, and we’ve changed the layout of the building at least five or six times in order to accommodate the neighbors as well as the city. What we did for the neighbors is we took all the driveways off their street and put them on Schoenherr, we also built a berm for them and then we are going to landscape the berm with pine trees so that it will be an all year round visual screening.

We’ve changed the design so that the buildings are more townhouse style apartments and working with the Planning Department we’ve come up with several different changes over the last year and we feel that we are at the point now where we hope that everybody including ourselves will be satisfied with the design.

Secretary Mouri reads the following correspondence:

**TAXES:** Current.

Mr. Ron Wuerth reads the recommendation of the Staff:

PUBLIC HEARING:

Ms. Lori Harris – I remember coming to some of the meetings where the residents were here from Industrial Drive, I'm not sure if this has been discussed with the residents. What I recall them talking about was the one building that he was going to put there looked like it was a jail. This is different, this is better, but I'm interested in why they are having the whole inside like the cars and that whole area facing the other resident's berms are not that high.

I also wonder why we're not hearing anything about the tree canopy and are the trees being taken down, remember these are things in the Master Plan. The tree canopy, the amount of cement in an area and the water. So I would love to hear you guys question that when it comes to the Council, but I really hope that they have approached the neighbors. I wonder if the neighbors were even notified about the last two meetings. I'm really surprised that nobody is here since there were quite a few that came out when this initially came up, so maybe that's something you can check on. Thank you.

MOTION:

A motion was made by Secretary Mouri to approve, supported by Vice Chair Boniecki.

COMMISSIONERS PORTION:

Secretary Mouri – I was looking through and one of the items says a recreational area will be provided, what type of recreational area are we talking about?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – Probably a picnic area with seating. The problem with playscapes is that we've had issues with playscapes that they tend to attract nonresidents and not necessarily to play. So we'll probably keep it fairly green with some walking areas and that sort of thing, low key.

Secretary Mouri – You're say maybe not like a playground?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – It will be a play area; it's not going to be a \$50,000.00 dollar play set. If you look on the map, there's two or three areas that are fairly large that kids could play on. I did the calculations based upon what was required but if I added all the green space I would far exceed the requirement, but we are not trying to do that. We want to make sure you guys are happy.

Secretary Mouri – There's going to be 21 townhouses that are going up, are you going to have any office location in that place or just homes?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – No the client's business is close by and that's going to act as the Manager's Office.

Secretary Mouri – How many parking spaces?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – I believe there's 40, we met the requirements.

Secretary Mouri – So 2 parking spaces per house is that the thinking?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – Yes.

Secretary Mouri – I also saw that there's only two ADA requirements, I know it meets the requirements.

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – Well first of all they're townhouses so none of them actually meet the ADA requirements, it's not required. We do have one unit that is what we call ADA accessible in the sense that we've lowered it. The other ones all have steps this one is lowered so someone in a wheelchair could enter and access the first floor.

Secretary Mouri – One of the last questions and I'm going to let the other Commissioners ask their questions. I was wondering in the email that you sent on November 14 it says the developer will provide some type of contact information, I guess once all this gets approved, how are you planning on providing that information to the citizens?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – We actually have been working, in fact several of them came last time and sat with us, we did everything they asked. They asked us to take the driveways off of Industrial and we did that. We stayed away from Schoenherr in order to make it easier for the tenants to pull in, it was asked for us not to do that so we changed it. Then they asked for some kind of a berm to keep the headlights out so we provided a 30 inch berm. They also asked if we could keep the visuals down and we did that's why we are going with (inaudible) trees on top of the berm. My guess is the reason why nobody is here is because they've seen the plan several times and they approved it and there's nothing to fight when we've given them everything we wanted.

Mr. Rafi Ahmad – There is nobody here.

Secretary Mouri – Are you going to be having some type of signage that will have some type of contact information?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – We'd automatically have a project sign just to tell everybody what's going to happen. We have beautiful color renderings, and we'll probably have the rendering and the sign and on that would be the contact information, that's what we traditionally do anyway.

Secretary Mouri – Thank you that's all I have.

Mr. Rafi Ahmad – Thank you very much.

Commissioner Robinson – I'm kind of curious you're going to have a designated proposed plaza area, now would that be that the residents can have grills out there?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – The area for grilling would be in the picnic area, that area would just be a decorative landscaped area for people to sit enjoy and maybe read book or something. We would have seats around it. It's basically a circle it's the square between the parking spaces no longer can park, so that area is about 25 x 25 foot area you'll have a circle with a walkway with a big tree in the center and then flowers around the trees and there will be benches to sit on.

Commissioner Robinson – But not to grill or anything?

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – No, we didn't want to put the grilling right in front of the units. First of all everybody has a patio in the back. Each unit has it's own patio in the back of the building in which they could place a bbq grill.

Commissioner Robinson – Okay. Do you know approximately what the rental rates would be?

Mr. Rafi Ahmad – We searched that area maybe \$1300.00 or \$1400.00 a month.

Ms. Mary Michaels – One point of clarification, in the agreement that you reviewed it does include the requirement that you provide the neighbors with a contact information, so if issues come up you'll be able to address them.

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – We will put that on the project sign. Do you have a list of names and we can send them emails; how do you want to do that.

Ms. Mary Michaels – We can coordinate that with you, but it is in the agreement.

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – Okay, maybe you can define how we can make that contact happen because we'd love to do that, how would we do that?

Ms. Mary Michaels – We can coordinate and give you the list.

Chair Smith – I really like the way you changed up the drawing from the original drawing moving the recreational area and the plaza. With that being said I think you've met the requirements that we are looking for in that area.

Mr. Jeffrey Graham – Thank you.

Mr. Rafi Ahmad – Thank you very much.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boneicki.....	Yes
Secretary Smith.....	Yes

7. CORRESPONDENCE:

None at this time.

8. OLD BUSINESS:

- A. 4<sup>th</sup> MINOR AMENDMENT TO THE APPROVED SITE PLAN FOR HOME DEPOT: Located on the northwest corner of Hoover Road and Engleman Avenue; Section 22; 25879 Hoover Road; John Chescavage/HD Development of Maryland, Inc. (Katie Fitzjarrald/Kimley-Horn and Associates. Inc.); PMA230009. Minor Amendment is to allocate space for outdoor storage, outdoor sales, and parking spaces. **Postponed from November 20<sup>th</sup>, 2023.**

PETITIONERS PORTION:

Mr. Matthew Hadar – Good evening, I’m here representing Katie Fitzjarrald. She wasn’t able to make it today so I’m representing Kimley Horn on her behalf, my name is Matt Hadar. I believe everybody has the plans in front of them with the revised site plan.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Mr. Chair, I think I’d like the petitioner to describe more about what is actually going to be put on and what’s been proposed on this plan before I give the recommendation.

Chair Smith – Could the petitioner come up and explain the difference that you discussed with the Planning Department.

Mr. Matthew Hadar – There’s a few main items to look at so one of the recommendations was to relocate all the storage along the sidewalk along the Hoover frontage to be located off of the sidewalk. So we moved everything off the sidewalk and then similarly to the rear of the building we removed everything from the property line and pushed it up against the building except for the propane tanks in the northeast corner. From the recommendation we protected around the propane tanks with bollards to provide additional protection. Then on the north side we are increasing the permanent storage for the pallets up from 1700 to 2393 square feet.

Chair Smith – Thank you sir.

Secretary Mouri reads the following correspondence:

- TAXES:** Current.
- FIRE:** Approved.
- MCDR:** No objection.

Mr. Ron Wuerth reads the recommendation of the Staff:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Tutt to recognize as the 4<sup>th</sup> minor amendment, supported by Commissioner Robinson.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

- Assistant Secretary Chowdhury..... Yes
- Commissioner Robinson..... Yes
- Commissioner Tutt..... Yes
- Commissioner Ansar..... Yes
- Secretary Mouri..... Yes

Vice Chair Boniecki..... Yes  
 Chair Smith..... Yes

**COMMISSIONERS PORTION:**

Chair Smith – Good evening, I noticed the changes that you made. I see that you worked with the Planning Department on those, and it looks good. I just had a question, on the garden side of the building where it says stack 2 pallets out and 8 feet high, I didn't understand what that was representing? Where you've got the purple area down at the bottom on the northeast side.

Mr. Matthew Harder – That's just indicating the total height during the seasonal storage. So those pallets are going to be stacks of mulch, each pallet is about 4 feet tall with all the mulch stacked on top of it and there's just going to be two of them stacked on top of each other.

Chair Smith – So it will be a maximum of 8 feet with the two pallets?

Mr. Matthew Hadar – Yes.

Chair Smith – And how far out from the fences there, will it be two pallets out from the fence too?

Ms. Diane Walkuski – Double stack with one row.

Chair Smith – Alright, very good. I noticed also in pro-parking that you eliminated that as being outdoor storage so that was okay because I know in know in your other drawing you had it highlighted as outdoor storage because it's pro-parking you didn't have to have outdoor storage on that area.

**MOTION:**

A motion was made by Secretary Mouri to approve, supported by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.

**ROLL CALL:**

The motion carried as follows:

Commissioner Robinson..... Yes  
 Commissioner Tutt..... Yes  
 Assistant Secretary Chowdhury..... Yes  
 Commissioner Ansar..... Yes  
 Secretary Mouri..... Yes  
 Vice Chair Boniecki..... Yes  
 Chair Smith..... Yes

- B. MINOR AMENDMENT FOR EXPANSION OF COMMERCIAL KITCHEN AREA (ANDIAMO): Located on the south side of Fourteen Mile Road, approximately 823.28 ft. west of Van Dyke Avenue; 7096 Fourteen Mile Road; Section 04; Joe Vicari/VCicari Realty (Robert A. Hoida/O-X Studio, Inc.). Minor amendment is for expansion of commissary kitchen area; PMA230010.

PETITIONERS PORTION:

Mr. Robert Hoida – Good evening, I'm with O-X Studio Architects we are out of Ann Arbor, Michigan, here representing Mr. Joe Vicari who is also in the audience should you have any questions for him.

Our request this evening is for a relatively minor kitchen addition to this building. The building total right now is about 28,000 square feet the addition that we are proposing is on the east side of the building taking up a row of parking spaces and that addition is 2551 square feet. We propose no changes to the site and the building appearance will mimic what's already there.

The other portions of this proposal we were asked to be combine, this property is presently composed of three different parcels of property, and they are zoned differently so we'd ask to combine those, so there is an application in to combine those three parcels into one. As part of that parceling of property we are also dedicating on the eastern portion, what is called parcel three on your site plan, is a piece of property that was never dedicated to the Macomb County Road Commission. So we would also like to do that dedication as well and these three parcels would be combined into one. I'm certainly happy to answer any questions about the building itself, there are no other changes proposed for the site. The site lighting, site layout, the parking obviously changes because we are taking a portion of it but everything else pretty much remains as is right now.

Secretary Mour reads the following correspondence:

**TAXES:** Current.

**FIRE:** Approved.

**MCPW:** Please be advised that this letter is for comment in relation to right of way and county drain easements only. It appears there will be no work within or near a county drain or easement, therefore this office would have no objection to this request. Prior to site plan approval, any proposed project that is under the jurisdiction of this office shall schedule an engineering meeting with this office to discuss how our standards may apply. To schedule a meeting with

Mary Clark CER-6819  
December 4<sup>th</sup>, 2023

this office please contact [heather.morin@macombgov.org](mailto:heather.morin@macombgov.org). Please contact this office should you have any questions, 586-469-5910.

Mr. Ron Wuerth reads the recommendation of the Staff:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Tutt to recognize as a minor amendment, supported by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes
Chair Smith.....	Yes

COMMISSIONERS PORTION:

Chair Smith – Good evening sir, I drove by and looked at the site today and I looked at your trash enclosure and it looks like it’s a double wide trash enclosure and it does have the cyclone fence around it with the slates in it also. That is far enough off the road you might want to talk to the Planning Commission to see if you really need to replace the whole thing. The problem I have is I know there’s a lot of outdoor storage there are pallets laying around, you have two large storage containers I could see on the semi, you had one large storage container it said cooling container and then you had a smaller storage container that was over by the two small buildings and there was also a pallet there that had bags of salt on it.

What I would like to, because this is the first drawing that I’ve seen that didn’t have any dimensions on it except for a couple of elevation drawings, it’s kind of hard to approve a job if you don’t have dimensions. I would recommend postponing this so we can get a revised drawing with the correct dimensions and also a location of all the open storage on the property and what’s going to be in the open storage units.

Mr. Joe Vicari – Good evening, I’m the owner of Andiamo’s. Those storage areas are portable storage and are there because we need more space. Some of them are refrigerated and also this is the busiest month of the year for us so a lot of that stuff won’t be there in January.

Chair Smith – But still we have areas that are seasonal also where they are not there all the time, even if they are going to be there at all we need to have a location of where these storage areas are and what’s going to be contained in those storage areas. We need to have that on the drawing so we can approve it on the drawing.

Mr. Robert Hoida – I’m certainly happy to do that, is the next meeting coming in 2 weeks?

Chair Smith – Okay so we will postpone it to the next meeting?

Mr. Robert Hoida – Yes, we can do that.

MOTION:

A motion was made by Secretary Mouri to postpone until December 18, 2023, supported by Vice Chair Boniecki.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes
Chair Smith.....	Yes

- C. SITE PLAN FOR LANDSCAPING FACILITY WITH OPEN STORAGE: Located on the east side of Groesbeck Highway, approximately 756.81 ft. north of Frazho Road; 26190 Groesbeck Highway; Section 24; Robert Kluck (Zachary Matouka/The Yard Men); PSP230036. **Site plan approved November 6<sup>th</sup>, 2023. Planning Commission approved performance bond of \$19,500.00 based on the estimated cost of \$650,000.00 provided by the petitioner at the time of application. Following site plan approval, the petitioner has submitted that the correct estimated cost is \$300,000.00 and is requesting a lower bond amount. Postponed from November 20<sup>th</sup>, 2023.**

Chair Smith – We received an email at the last minute that the petitioner wasn’t able to make it this evening and he wants to have it postponed until December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2023.

MOTION:

Mary Clark CER-6819  
December 4<sup>th</sup>, 2023

A motion was made by Secretary Mouri to postpone until December 18, 2023, supported by Vice Chair Boniecki.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes
Chair Smith.....	Yes

D. SITE PLAN FOR OPEN STORAGE OF LANDSCAING MATERIALS:

Located on the west side of Blackstone Avenue, approximately 596 ft. south of Stephens Road; 23831 Blackstone; Section 26; James Malkiewicz (Jack Durbin). **Approved on June 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2019; First extension approved to December 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2022; Second extension approved to December 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2023. Petitioners request a third extension to December 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2024.**

PETITIONERS PORTION:

Ms. Jaclyn Malkiewicz – Good evening, I’m standing in for James today. We are requesting an extension. All the work is completed we have gone through Zoning, which has been approved and the site plans have been provided. I think we are just waiting for, I’m not sure the exact steps on this, but we are just waiting for the site plan approval I believe and be signed off. So we are just requesting that extension for that to get done.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Considering the fact that this started on June 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2019. They talk as though they are going to get it done in a short time period, I don’t think a year is good, but I think give them six months to finish this and get all the information into us that’s needed. If they don’t do it by June of 2024 then I think they are going to have to come back for site plan approval because we don’t know what kind of changes have been made out there in these 4 ½ to almost 5 years. I would not go any more then six months, that is my recommendation.

Secretary Mouri – I know you said you don’t know the last steps that need to be done, is there a lot of work that needs to be done still?

Ms. Jaclyn Malkiewicz – No, actually all the work on the site plans have been completed. I’m a nurse and my husband works full time

at GM so this whole process is new to us. We actually met with Ron last year to go over the site plans before it went to zoning because we weren't sure about those steps. It went to zoning, zoning approved the changes for I believe it was the parking that needed to be done because there's not enough room so there had to be a variance for that and the site plan has been updated. During this time when it started in 2019 Covid happened, then something happened with our Architect, so we had to find a whole new Architect during the through Covid time.

This has been redrawn by a new Architect and then updated because there was a misspelled word. Everything has been done, we are just waiting for it to be signed off. And again, I don't know how long that's going to take, I'm good with six months. Trees are planted, vinyl is in the fence to keep it out of sight, the lines have been painted, and the sprinklers are in and been winterized this year. We are just waiting for an inspection.

Chair Smith – Being you just have a few things left to do I think six months would be enough time versus a whole extension. So we are going to grant a six month extension which will take it to June 10<sup>th</sup>, 2024.

MOTION:

A motion was made by Secretary Mouri for a six month extension until June 10<sup>th</sup>, 2024, supported by Commissioner Tutt.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes
Chair Smith.....	Yes

9. BOND RELEASE:

SITE PLAN FOR NEW CONDO BUILDINGS: Located on the northeast corner of Ryan Road and Tuxedo Drive; 4009-4042 Alia Drive (formerly Kristin); Section 5; Sermed Saif (Safaa Alzobeidi). **Approved on June 18<sup>th</sup>, 2018. Cash bond posted in the amount of \$3000.00. Completed; release the bond.**

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Tutt to release the bond, supported by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boneicki.....	Yes
Chair Smith.....	Yes

10. NEW BUSINESS:

Discussion and review of 2024-2025 Planning Department Budget.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – You’ve all received the Planning Commission proposed fiscal budget this is from July 1<sup>st</sup>, 2024 to June 30<sup>th</sup>, 2025. I can go through this and if you have questions, suggestions, additions, or any of that type of thing after I’m finished then please let me know. This is your budget; I want to make that clear.

As you turn the page you come to the table of contents and each page is numbered and the general subject of each page is in the table of contents, so you can take a look through there. Next page is titled Planning, and it is very much like the page that the Budget Director puts out for the Planning Department a description of planning in a somewhat general sense. It’s just an introductory page that they have with their numbers.

Next is page 2, it says memorandum and that goes to the Honorable Lori M. Stone, Mayor, and it’s from the Commission and the date is to be determined, but again this is the budget that comes from us. We go to page 3 we talk about the accomplishments that the Planning Commission has done in the last fiscal year. It’s a nice breakdown here so you can take a look at square footage and that sort of thing and discussions about other things. Our relationship with SEMCO, there’s a GIS Group, there’s Environmental Advisory Groups, things of that nature that we work with.

Page 4 talks about the past fiscal year and the projects that we were involved with you see there’s a whole page of bullet points. Near the bottom we talk about prior planning commission and planning

department budgets as you can see the costs have gone up. I will say that has to do with personnel numbers mostly.

Page 5 we get into more information talking about activities that we anticipate will take place during the next coming year and we talk about the current day to day issues. There are 23 subjects I'm not going to read all these, it's a lot, it's a lot of what we do on a daily basis, we are busy all the time. Thank God we are going to pick up two new people one on 15<sup>th</sup> and that's Shirley Taylor, Office Assistant. And then a new Assistant Planner and that's Amanda Mika. So both of them will help us quite a bit especially in the administration part we've just been overwhelmed and now it's going to clearly get us back on board where I like to be.

We talk about the current things in planning the special projects that we are looking forward to doing, as a matter of fact that's a short list.

1. Work with other departments and divisions to amend the Zoning Ordinance as needed.
2. Incorporate an active and ongoing Geographic Information System (GIS) with computer mapping at the personal computer level into the planning process for the City of Warren. The development of GIS applications into the City's Planning process will enable the department to apply technology and skills that are becoming essential for any modern planning office.
3. Pursue Federal funding for the City's Urban planning issues.
4. Completed the Village District Plan in August 2022. It was completed in August of 2022. We are now talking about implementation.
5. Work and finish the Van Dyke Corridor Plan.
6. Work on the Housing Study. We've been talking about and we are trying to be in lockstep with the State of Michigan when it comes with the high need of housing in the State of Michigan and right here in this city with new people that arrive here.

I'll go next to Planning – Short Range there's about 13 different things on the short list. Long Range Planning, there's 3 items there that we are looking at and most of it all having to do with the Master Plan. We are in about our third year, and every five years it's mandated that we update that Master Plan. We find out what accomplishments we've made according to the plan and what next should be done. Our Master Plan Committee will become very active this year.

Down at the bottom it talks about statements regarding our personnel and a short paragraph about each one of us, just some basic information. We are still waiting on the Administrative

Secretary, that's the person who's going to lead our Administration, part of the Planning Department. David has done an amazing job at working at that and continuing to stay with us has been quite a job for him and I commend him.

On page 8 statements regarding operating expense budget. Here's the typical stuff, sort of speak, the office supplies, overtime, contractual services, postage, printing, publishing. Next page number 9, memberships that helps keep us all educated, and we need to continue learning all the time. Then down here we have the Planning Meeting allowance and that's the amount currently for 24 meetings for a year.

Next page 10, that shows and indicates budget approved projects. Just to show that we do keep busy besides doing what you see right here every two weeks we come in, see this book and there's about 50 pages sometimes 75 pages, it's a book every two weeks that the staff puts together. Imagine doing that for a few years. On the budget approved projects.

1. Master Plan.
2. Zoning Ordinance.
3. Digital Zoning Map (revised to include Zoning Map & GIS Analysis). There's the budgeted year as you can see, the consultant and the department funds.
4. BTRC Ordinance (revised to include BTRC District) and we're looking to see that come into play very soon now. The Attorney's Office particularly Mary Michaels she's worked hand in hand with General Motors to make sense of what they want and what we think they should get.
5. Housing Study.
6. Green Space Conservation Plan. A very important piece to the pie is a Green Space Conservation Plan that we need in this town. There seems to be little respect for any kind of greenspace. I'm talking about areas where you've got wild trees and grass. You look along the Red Run Drain and that's what you see down through there, just take a look. They are wild areas, and they need to be there, we don't need all the grass cut down to six inches. We need trees planted for the air, trees planted so that they can handle the water the heavy rains that we have, and shrubs. The Engineering Division has notified us that rain gardens and bioswales are something that shall be incorporated in all of the site plans that we get from now on. Even the ones that we've already heard, they are incorporating those types of things. Drainage systems, it's complicated but yet it works. We are going to look at the whole City on the Green Space Conservation Plan.

7. Non-Motorized Transportation Plan. Basically, that's a bicycle plan and any other types of vehicles that people use and will run on proposed paths in this city.
8. Neighborhood Plan. All the neighborhoods in the city how they work and if they need any rejuvenation we are going to try and get grants going. I can tell you that the Mayor is excited about working with organizations, The State of Michigan, SEMCO, and all others that provide grants or cost sharing types of funding to get things going in this city.
9. Complete Streets/Multi-Modal Plan. We will take a look at what we can do with some of our streets so that they can be used by everything not just cars.

Page 11, that's the Projective Revenue. What we actually take in on a yearly basis, it may not seem like much. So in this case we have a projected amount of \$164,700.00 of monies that we would take in and that would go to the General Fund.

Page 12, that's the end of the letter here from Warren Smith going to the Mayor.

The next page is the proposed Planning Commission and Staff Organization that we have and still being changed even as of today when I saw it. It will have the same names on it the boxes will be moved around a little more but other than that you see what you see.

After that we get into the schedules that we like to use. This particular one is called Planning. It's the Operating Expense Budget Manning Table and it indicates everyone who works there and what the wages are and what we think we need as far as any additions in personnel.

Next, we talk about a position we think we will need in the near future and that is an Assistant Planning Director. And that person will be the Director when I'm not here and not available. There are times like that I'm in and out of the office and like any of the other people taking time off, that's especially when that person would be active doing that. You can see some description of when the Assistant Planner will do. It's a job I held for about 15 years and the way I see it it's needed as soon as we can get one in.

We have page 20, Performance Objective/Indicators. It's all a list of things we do what we project and these items you'll see that are required by the Budget Director. You've got the personnel, a five-year budget plan. Down at the bottom it says Planner I and Planner II positions to be added at a future point, as needed time frame, to

be determined and that's probably dependent upon how well Assistant Planners do and how well the Planner III does and how they can move up the ladder into Planner I position or Planner II position or an Assistant Planner Director position.

Page 22, we are looking at Meeting Allowance but this all has to do with allowances for the meetings and the current allowance in this case \$75.00 dollars that's per Planning Commissioner. And all the places that Planning Commissioners are paid for certain meetings as they are required to attend. Office supplies just are the general things that we do, I'm not going to get too detailed on that. Overtime normal. The contractual service that's for compensation and right off the bat is our Court Recorder. Professional needs and attendees to the Planning Commission Meetings. Miscellaneous items like professional assistance on training on projects that's zoning ordinance, maps and other planning studies. Yearly maintenance by consultant for the zoning map update training and input.

Neighborhood plan in progress, carry over. Complete streets multi modal plan and that's in progress and that's a carry over. And then we have a Technical Consultant if needed to help with the implementation of specific plans. Page 26, postage pretty well talks about itself. Next page 27, printing and publishing. Page 28, membership and dues it includes, most importantly we'll say, SEMCOG. There's a yearly charge from them at \$17,875.00 and it's worth every cent of the information that they are able to provide. That's called the Southeast Michigan Council of Governments, it's very important organization.

So with that I present the budget in a very general way, so if you have any questions, additions or anything you want to talk about I'll attempt to answer the questions.

Commissioner Robinson – Regarding the Assistant Planning Director you indicated that this individual will sort of mimic what you do when you're not there. This is a full time position, correct?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – It is.

Commissioner Robinson – But you emphasized they will fulfill some of the duties that you perform when you're not there so are you going to be away for an extended period of time during the year where this is justifiable and in particular with the salary that the Assistant will be compensated is quite hefty. So I guess maybe I want a little clarification on exactly what they will be doing. Are you intending to be gone for long periods of time?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – No I'm not going to be gone long periods of time, but I will be gone on the time that I've earned over the years of being here. Some people might think it's significant, but I don't think so, like anyone you need some time off vacation time or however one wants to use that time off. When it happens, or when I get ill, or when I go away to Map Conferences and things of that nature and I am not here then that person takes over for me and behaves as the Planning Director. That's what I did for about 15 years.

There's also a technical payment aspect to that if someone takes over right now then ideally, it's dependent upon situations but that person potentially could be paid on an hourly wage the same as I for the time they are taking over at this point. The Assistant Planner is paid more and that's to cover that particular aspect of their wage as they take over for me on a limited basis. Does that make sense? That's what this is all about is to take care of that aspect.

We had a Planning Director, an Assistant Planning Director, a secretary, and a Planner Aide for 15 years and now we've managed to expand a bit, so we have extra people, but we still need that coverage. So I'm hoping that when it comes to the discussion with the Administration and City Council they'll understand that needs to be done and we'll get that position filled.

Commissioner Robinson – I guess maybe I was concerned about the salary of the Assistant Planner.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – That's normal, it's absolutely normal.

Commissioner Robinson – Okay.

Commissioner Tutt – I have two things, first to the Planning Department our Court Reporter and our City Attorney and even Warren's wife thank you so much for always supporting us in your own way because we couldn't do what we do without your guys support, so thank you for that.

Secondly, I was checking out page 22 specifically pertaining to the Commissioners pay, my question is the budget is for nine Commissioners this year alone we have not had nine Commissioners, so the excess from that budget does it rollover to our new budget? The reason I ask is because I believe between the seven consistent commissioners that we've had this year alone we've earned an increase in pay. At the bottom of page 22 I see where it says explanation for increase is that something that we

would submit to who, do we submit it or do we ask you to submit it in my opinion is that it's been justified of course, so how would that work?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – It's not on my page 22, what does it say?

Commissioner Tutt – Operating Expense Budget.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – And it doesn't have an explanation, is that what you're talking about?

Commissioner Tutt – Yes, so my question is who submits that explanation, would it come from us or would we ask you to submit it on our behalf, how does that work?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Well we've had explanations in the past this has become such normal thing that all of this that you see it hasn't needed to be explained.

Commissioner Tutt – I think I might misunderstand, how I'm reading it is would we provide an explanation as to why we are requesting an increase. Or does that mean if the increase was already listed here it would provide an explanation for that.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Who is requesting the increase you yourself or you for the Commission?

Commissioner Tutt – Well that's my question how would that work, could I do that because I definitely would?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – You yourself can certainly say that you think you want to be paid more per meeting. So you indicate that to me, this is again your budget. At this point it's \$75.00 dollars per meeting and if you think you need to be paid more you simply indicate that you do need it. We'd like to have an explanation of whatever you want to say for that raise.

Commissioner Tutt – So my first question was the access of the budget for us having a nine member board and for a year we have not had a nine member board. Do those funds rollover to add onto this budget how does that work, or do those monies just go away?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – It does not rollover, it just sits unused in the budget that's how it shows up.

Commissioner Tutt – Does that support the meeting allowance? For example I do plan on submitting an explanation for an increase for

the seven Commissioners that consistently show up that would change the balance that's allowed for these meetings, but we have this pocket of money would that support the increase?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – I'm not so sure it would, the intent is that all of you become reinstated as Planning Commissioners first by City Council and you need that.

Commissioner Tutt – Yes, we've needed that for a long time.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Well it's not on me, now it's on the new Mayor and it's on the City Council, how they handle that. It's supposed to be nine people and if they handle it correctly it will be nine people not seven. So that amount of money that you're talking about just didn't get used for this past fiscal year.

Commissioner Tutt – I enjoy how you get riled up when I ask you questions. It gets exciting, that's why I asked because I just don't know.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – I'm just trying to explain it.

Commissioner Tutt – So who would I submit this explanation to you or do I send it via email to David?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – You can send it to both of us. Why don't you have that discussion with the Planning Commissioners and discuss how you'd like to word something. State the reason why the Planning Commission should have a raise from \$75.00 dollars per meeting to a certain amount, whatever you think is fair. Get it to me as soon as possible because we are approving this in 2 weeks.

Commissioner Tutt – Thank you.

Chair Smith – In addition to Ms. Tutt's response about a rate increase, we are the third largest city in Michigan, we do have a lot of things coming before us within the next couple years and it does seem like we should get some sort of increase. Some other communities that aren't as big as we are give their members a \$100.00 dollars per meeting, I thought we should get a \$150.00 per meeting.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Ask for what you think is fair to all of you.

Commissioner Tutt – You said some cities pay their commissioner \$100.00 per meeting.

Chair Smith – I've heard that I haven't seen it in writing. Like I said, being the third largest city and we've got a lot going on we are going to have a lot more responsibility, so we need to have some sort of increase. We can sit and collaborate and see what we feel is a good amount and then we can submit that amount to the planning commission.

Commissioner Tutt – I definitely agree, I think in our group chat we can work out how and when we can meet to do that.

Commissioner Robinson – Do we send the comments or the consensus to you as what are thoughts are?

Chair Smith – Either me or Ron probably.

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury – Let's do one email from all the commissioners all together.

Ms. Mary Michaels – I just have to interject, the open meetings act you can't make a decision or even confer if there's more than a majority or more than a quorum. So either host a special meeting or maybe just make it an item of discussion when you approve to make those amendments. No email with the entire group, please.

Chair Smith – I think we should have a rate increase how much I don't know. So just give me an idea a ballpark of what you think it might be or what you would want and we can try and work something out along that line.

Secretary Mouri – I would \$130.00 to \$150.00 within that range.

Commissioner Robinson – I think \$100.00 would be satisfactory, it takes gas to drive to the locations.

Chair Smith – A lot of these decisions are going to be based on if we are all reappointed or not, so that will make a difference also. I'm just looking at what our job is what we do and what will be involved in the future with more things that we have to do. That's what I'm basing it on.

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury – When will we know if we will be reappointed, do we have a date?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – If anyone wants information regarding that issue you must contact the mayor that's who you will have to work with,

the new Mayor. She's very approachable. I've spoken to her many times now in just the short amount of time that she's been here. It's an issue that needs to get fixed. I don't know how many times I can tell people that this board needs to be on solid ground. We need another person if everything goes well with John he'll be back so really it's just one person at this point.

Commissioner Tutt – I understand that us being recommissioned is a concern, but I don't want that to distract you from us having to submit an explanation because they are meeting on this next week. So yes, we do have to be reappointed but, in the meantime, let's work on this explanation and get it sent over.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Do you have a consensus right now on how much, if you don't then send me something in the next week.

Secretary Mouri – \$130.00 per meeting.

Commissioner Tutt – I support \$130.00.

Vice Chair Boniecki – I agree with the \$130.00.

Chair Smith – I'll go with \$130.00 also.

Commissioner Ansar – Yes.

Commissioner Robinson – I'll go with the consensus.

Chair Smith – Mr. Wuerth we are looking at \$130.00.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Alright I'll make the changes.

Chair Smith – As far as the postage you got postage at \$8000.00, I know that postage is going up next year is that going to cover any additional postage because it's going up?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – I spoke to David and he thinks there's no problem with that.

Chair Smith – Thank you sir.

11. CITIZEN PARTICIPATION:

Ms. Lori Harris – It's interesting listening to the budget discussion, you can't see anything that's being talked about, but I was impressed by his (inaudible) that this is your budget. So Commissioner Tutt props to you for bringing up an important issue in

terms of your compensation. I understand the Master Plan Committee will be active, I heard him talk about greenspace, conservation and trees, bioswales, and raingardens required. I'm just so confused when he talked about greenspace why the recommendation was to destroy the Barber Street area for a building. If these things have been on the radar and are important then it needs to start happening now and I've been reminding you that you guys are in charge of the Building Department and you need to not be afraid to ask questions and to understand where this all fits into the Master Plan.

I also want to put on the record that I am positive that Mr. Crabtree delivered all the documents to Mr. Newnan and Ms. Melody Magee before this meeting and they are not present. I was at the committee of the whole meeting when they were eager to be part of this process and I'm pretty disappointed they are not here. Now of course if they are sick that would make a difference, but I still find that unacceptable. I hope that everybody has a lovely holiday. I'll probably see you again in two weeks. Keep fighting for what's right for you guys and good luck.

Chair Smith – Thank you, you have a nice holiday also.

12. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS:

**A) Planning Director's Report:**

Mr. Ron Wuerth – The last couple of weeks, as I said in the previous presentation, I've met with Mayor Stone several times on a number of issues talking about this planning commission and the fact that you all need to get reinstated. That is at the top of the list and she's working on that, however, her door is open, you can come in just about any time you want go to the desk and you will see the Mayor sitting there working on things. She looks up, she smiles, she waves and says come on in, that's they type of person we have right now, and I appreciate that. You should meet her because this is the person that requests the appointment from the City Council and I would suggest that each and every one of you make an effort to contact her.

I've discussed several things with her and all these plans that we want to do Michelle has initiated a grant right off the bat. It was one that was talked about just last week, on Friday she hurried, she got it in and they are overjoyed in the Mayor's Office. These are the types of things we want to do and it's for the citizens and this Mayor wants

to get things going like that, so we will work on it as we see these things coming.

I've been at a couple of meetings with the Warren Fire Department still talking about the new fire establishment and facility on Van Dyke and the one that's going to go on Schoenherr and all the details that go into it and let me tell you it's detailed. Skip McAdam and his Fire Chief are there at every meeting looking at things.

Our first actual Mayor's Meeting was on the 20<sup>th</sup> of November all the Directors were there it was a very good face to face meeting in the Village Room and we all appreciated that. After that I had this meeting with a gentleman named Tom Tamou, he wants to reinstate a recent site plan approval for Hayes and Fourteen where there was to be a Kum & Go Gas Station it will be called something else now because the people have left the State of Michigan. They had over 15 facilities that they were going to build and I think they were bought out and they changed their whole status here in Michigan. So Tom is a local builder and has been for many years, so he's taking this over. Our Chief Assistant Attorney was at the meeting, and she helped out a lot to explain the legal aspects of taking the job over and moving it forward.

We had our internal budget meeting where we discussed things. The staff attended the discussion of The Historic District change in ordinance language and also a second change in the Zoning Ordinance regarding public Artworks we went over that with Laura from the Attorney's Office. That's basically been it other than us just trying to keep our head above the water. If you have any questions, I'd be glad to answer them.

**B) Planning Commission Discussion and Concerns:**

None at this time.

13. CALENDAR OF PENDING MATTERS:

None at this time.

14. ADJOURNMENT:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Robinson to adjourn, supported by Commissioner Tutt. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:41 p.m.

---

Warren Smith, Chair

---

Mahmuda Mouri, Secretary

Meeting recorded and transcribed by  
Mary Clark - CER-6819

**E-mail: [maryclark130@gmail.com](mailto:maryclark130@gmail.com)**