

3 CITY OF WARREN
PLANNING COMMISSION
PUBLIC HEARING

Regular Meeting held on December 18th, 2023, at 7:00 p.m.,

A Regular Meeting of the Warren Planning Commission was called for Monday, December 18th, 2023, at 7:00 p.m., in the Warren Community Center Auditorium, 5460 Arden, Warren, Michigan 48092.

Commissioners Present:

Sultana Chowdhury, Assistant Secretary
Claudette Robinson
Michelle Tutt
Delwar Ansar
Mahmuda Mouri, Secretary
Merle Boniecki, Vice Chair
Henry Newnan, Ex-Officio
Melody Magee, Ex-Officio

Also present:

Ron Wuerth – Planning Director
Michelle Katopodes – Planner III
David Crabtree – Assistant Planner
Amanda Mika – Assistant Planner
Susan Heydel – Administrative Clerk
Shirley Taylor – Office Assistant
Mary Michaels - Assistant City Attorney
Patrick Conlin - Communications Department

1. CALL TO ORDER:
Vice Chair Boniecki - Calls the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:
3. ROLL CALL:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Tutt to excuse Commissioner Kupiec and Chair Smith, supported by Commissioner Robinson. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

4. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Tutt to approve, supported by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES DECEMBER 4TH, 2023:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Robinson to approve, supported by Commissioner Tutt. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

6. PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS:

Members of the audience who wish to address the Planning Commission this evening for a public hearing item may do so by first checking in with the court reporter at the right of the stage and will have three (3) minutes to speak.

- A. SITE PLAN FOR SELF STORAGE FACILITY: Two properties located on the north and south side of Ten Mile Road, approximately 326.85 ft. east of Mound Road; Sections 21 and 28; 6014 and 6015 Ten Mile Road (formerly DeCarlo's Banquet and Convention Center). Frank Jarbou/SHE Warren, LLC; PSP230038.

PETITIONERS PORTION:

Mr. Tom Kalas – I'm here in lieu of Mr. Jarbo, unfortunately he couldn't be here this evening, he sends his apologies. This is our site plan for a self-storage facility on Ten Mile Road on the east side of Mound both on the north and south side. You'll see the very detailed plans that were submitted, elevations, site plan layouts, landscaped plans. This was a matter that actually came in front of you previously for a conditional rezoning from the prior commercial and residential and parking uses to a light industrial to allow for this self storage facility. DeCarlo's Building will be repurposed will be a climate controlled indoor storage facility. We are going to have drive up buildings also for self storages as you can see on the site plan.

This is a development that will improve the area, it's going to clean up the DeCarlo's site. We are going to provide improvements, landscaping, plantings. We are cutting off access to Kaltz Road on the east and to Braun Drive on the north. It will be a facility that's gated with security cameras. There will be an onsite manager during working hours. You can only gain access in and out with a security Fob. The hours of the operation, I believe, will be from 8:00

am to 5:00 pm. From 5:00 p.m., until 11:00 p.m., the only access allowed will be for people that actually have units there and they can only get in with their security Fob. From 11:00 p.m., until 6:00 a.m., no one will be allowed on site, there's no business on site, no deliveries nothing like that. We are providing enhanced walls, we are providing a minimum of 8 foot high trees for screening so it's going to be a nice development. It's going to clean up that site. It's a very low impact use compared to what could be there under a prior commercial zoning and even under a light industrial zoning. As you know it's a conditional zoning so there's an agreement that we are bound to adhere to that's been prepared by your city attorney that we can only use the site for the self storage facility.

Again it's low impact minimal uses, minimal visits, pedestrian vehicular so it's really a nice use, it will clean up the site. It will add screening, landscaping, lighting, and security. The big issue with the residents from the rezoning is the access to and from Kaltz Road which will now be totally terminated. There will be no access in and out from that road or from Braun Road to the north. The only access in from Ten Mile will be if you're coming westbound as you can see on the site plan you can come in from Ten Mile. For the property on the south side you have to go eastbound to get in and coming out of the property to the north the only way out will be up there, on the north, you can see out to Mound Road and then heading north, you can't make a left turn.

We've taken all kinds of concerns into consideration with traffic, vehicular circulation and we feel that this is a nice site. We did note some comments from the city regarding the site plan, those comments are easily addressed, and we will address them. A couple of the items were certain notes where not noted on the plans which we will do very easily with no problem. We feel that we are ready for Planning Commission approval. If there's any questions, I'm available, applicant representative Mr. Travis O'Connell (sic) is also here if you have any specific questions. Thank you.

Secretary Mouri reads the following correspondence:

TAXES: Current.

ENGINEERING:

1. Sites shall comply with the current City of Warren storm water ordinance. All storm discharge must be contained in the parcels. Detention and pre-treatment shall be required for each parcel.
2. Provide a detailed storm narrative on site plan.

Mary Clark CER-6819
December 18th, 2023

3. Site plan shall show and identify the location of all existing and proposed underground utilities including size, connection and discharge point in the vicinity of the project.
4. The outside perimeter of all paved/parking spaces shall be minimum 6-inch concrete curb and gutter.
5. Any construction within the 10 Mile Road right of way and Mound Road right of way shall require a permit from the Macomb County Department of Roads.

FIRE: Approved.

MCDR: Macomb County Department of Roads (MCDR) has received and reviewed the enclosed preliminary plan for the above referenced site. MCDR has no objections to proposed development at above mentioned site. If you have any questions, please contact me at the number above (586) 463-8671.

MCPW: Please be advised that this letter is for comment in relation to right of way and county drain easements only. It appears there will be no work within or near a county drain or easement, therefore this office would have no objection to this request. Please note that the nearest county drains are the Bear Creek Warren Branch No. 2 on the north side of Ten Mile and the Cramer Drain on the east side of Peter Kaltz Drive. Both of which would have an influence on the 6015 Ten Mile site. Any work within those easements would require review and approval through this office. Prior to site plan approval, any proposed project that is under advisement to schedule an engineering meeting with this office to discuss how our standards may apply. To schedule a meeting with this office please contact heather.morin@macombgov.org. Please contact this office, should you have any questions, (586) 469-5910.

Mr. Ron Wuerth reads the recommendation of the Staff:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Robinson to approve, supported by Commissioner Tutt.

COMMISSIONERS PORTION:

Secretary Mouri – Is this one of the first self-storage that you're building, do you have any throughout any other cities?

Mr. Tom Kalas – The client has built other self-storages.

Secretary Mouri – How long have they been in business, when was the first one they built?

Mr. Tom Kalas – That I can't answer but they do quite a few of these.

Secretary Mouri – Do you usually attract more people in this self-storage versus a regular one?

Mr. Tom Kalas – There's an onsite Manager during the day and you have to have a Fob to get in with a security code that's limited to the customer signing a rental contract. I don't know if that answers your question. It's a very limited use as far as people will go there, it's not a use for people to go there everyday and obviously it's a storage facility. They go there perhaps to put things in when they are moving and then hardly check on it maybe once a month. It's not like an office for commercial use where you've got daily pedestrian and vehicular traffic, most of them are like that that are gated and secured.

Secretary Mouri – The parking spaces are 31 correct?

Mr. Tom Kalas – Yes.

Secretary Mouri – How many units do you have?

Mr. Tom Kalas – There's going to be based on the site plan 16 buildings, obviously we have to go through Engineering which could modify that somewhat, it's approximately 700 units total.

Secretary Mouri – With 31 parking spaces you don't think you'll have more customers at one time?

Mr. Tom Kalas – No not really, it's not like it's a dinner rush hour and you have an influx of traffic. It's open during the day, people come at their convenience and really the parking is more than adequate because there's just not a lot of traffic and you don't need a lot of parking for this type of facility. The parking spaces that we provide we believe are adequate, obviously any variances that are required we will apply for those variances with your Zoning Board.

Secretary Mouri – The variance is like 52?

Mr. Tom Kalas – I think it was 58 spaces and we have 31.

Secretary Mouri – Looking at that with the units I was just kind of thinking about that. That's one of the reasons I was asking since

you're building other storages, so you don't think you'll get more clients at the same time as this?

Mr. Tom Kalas – Not really, no. If you visit any climate controlled gated secured facility you'll see there's hardly any traffic there or any visitors.

Secretary Mouri – What's the rush hour would you say?

Mr. Tom Kalas – There really isn't. Someone might go on a weekend, someone else might go on a Friday afternoon, but again it's not a place you visit frequently or often. I have stuff in these types of facilities. Once I put everything there I haven't even gone back to check on it because it's secured and gated. There are lights, cameras, all that good stuff, there's no reason to go back unless you need to go retrieve something typically.

Secretary Mouri – That's all I have, thank you.

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury – Have you had a chance to review all the recommendations, and do you agree with all the recommendations?

Mr. Tom Kalas – Yes, we have no objections, in fact our Engineer looked at them and they've addressed them. They did provide us with a letter. Unfortunately, it was too late to provide to the Planning Commission, but we have no objections with any of the recommendations.

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury – Thank you.

Commissioner Ansar – How many units have the climate are all of them regular?

Mr. Tom Kalas – How many are climate controlled?

Commissioner Ansar – Yes.

Mr. Tom Kalas – The ones that are in DeCarlo's building will all be climate controlled. That's a 42,000 square foot building, maybe 200 somewhere in there.

Commissioner Ansar – So out of 700, 200 is climate controlled?

Mr. Tom Kalas – Yes, the other ones you’ll have the storage buildings but they are not climate controlled. Obviously they are less expensive and people like the drive up ones too that aren’t climate controlled for things that don’t need climate control. It’s a variation, it provides flexibility it’s not strictly indoor climate you can choose depending on the demographics and the user you have the availability of climate controlled or not and different sizes obviously.

Commissioner Ansar – Thank you.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes

- B. SITE PLAN FOR TRUCK AND TRAILER PARKING, STAGIN, AND STORAGE: Located on the south side of Nine Mile Road, approximately 160 ft. west of Warner Avenue; Section 31;2700 Nine Mile Road; Liliya Skikun/Great Lakes Trucking MI, Inc. (Paul Reschke/Spartan Real Estate Group); PSP230037.

PETITIONERS PORTION:

Mr. Paul Reschke – Good evening, this is an ongoing project, I think we’ve been before you three or four times now, it’s got a lot of moving parts, there’s four different parcels. We were before you early July for conditional rezoning of the four parcels and that was based on the concept site plan which is the site plan that we are submitting and that was approved. Then we went before City Council, and they approved it also.

I think we were before you early September for one of the side lots that’s at the corner of Nine Mile and Warner and that was for parking of cars, you approved that too. Engineering plans are being developed for that and we should have all the engineering plans developed to submit this week. There’s a couple of variances that will be required one for the number of parking spaces and then something related to the setback up on Nine Mile. Then the Planning Commission has sited a few things but most of them are just paper that the engineers Nowak & Fraus, our Engineer, is in the

process of addressing right now. We agree with all the conditions, and we are moving forward on that part of it. I'm open for any questions.

Secretary Mouri reads the following correspondence:

TAXES: Current.

ENGINEERING:

1. Sites shall comply with the current City of Warren storm water ordinance. All storm discharge must be contained in the parcels. Detention and pretreatment shall be required.
2. Provide a detailed storm narrative on site plan.
3. Parcels dedication shall be required. The City of Warren shall require a 33 inch right of way dedication from parcel 12-13-31-126-003 and 60 ft. right of way from parcel 12-13-31-126-009.
4. Parcels combination shall be required.
5. Site plan shall show and identify all the parcels including the parcels identification numbers prior to combination.
6. Site plan shall show and identify the location of all existing and proposed underground utilities including size, connection, and discharge point in the vicinity of the project including their sizes, connections and discharge point.

FIRE: Approved.

MCDR: Macomb County Department of Roads (MCDR) has received and reviewed the enclosed preliminary plan for the above referenced site. MCDR has no objections to proposed development at above mentioned site. If you have any questions, please contact me at the number above (586) 463-8671.

MCPW: No Objections.

Mr. Ron Wuerth reads the recommendations of the Staff:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Robinson to approve, supported by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.

COMMISSIONERS PORTION:

Commissioner Robinson – I'm glad that you worked with the neighbors throughout this whole process that was critical.

Mr. Paul Reschke – Thank you. I forgot to mention that because I believe that was very important.

Commissioner Robinson – Through every step of the way you addressed all of their concerns and that's commendable.

Mary Clark CER-6819
December 18th, 2023

Mr. Paul Reschke – Thank you.

Secretary Mouri – How do you let truckers know not to drive through a residential road?

Mr. Paul Reschke – They won't have any access to the property. The access you see is for fire purposes we are anticipating that they will want that in the plan just in case, it will have full circulation around the property and that's gated with knox box that only the fire department has the keys to. That's how we keep them off of Warner. Most of the drivers are familiar already, there could be new ones that will go through a training process, they only have one way into the property and out of the property.

Secretary Mouri – Do you usually include that in the training materials like make sure you're not going through some residential to skip traffic or anything like that?

Mr. Paul Reschke – Oh yea, there's a lot of recommendations and guidelines that they have to adhere to. There's a lot of insurance in the trucking industry and if you get cited for things up goes the insurance rates. Harold who is here is the Operations Manager and he does a great job of educating people.

Secretary Mouri – Thank you.

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury – Will there be proper signage posted around the area?

Mr. Paul Reschke – Absolutely.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes

Mr. Paul Reschke – Thank you very much. Happy Holidays, Merry Christmas.

7. CORRESPONDENCE:

SITE PLAN FOR OUTDOOR DINING AREA FOR EXISTING RESTAURANT: Located on the west side of Ryan Road; approximately 248 ft. south of Eleven Mile Road; 26837 Ryan Road; Section 19; Steven Savich (Sima Birach). **Approved on April 22nd, 2019. Extension approved to December 3rd, 2023. Never finished, expired.**

MOTION:

A motion was made by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury to receive and file, supported by Commissioner Tutt.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes

8. OLD BUSINESS:

A. MINOR AMENDMENT FOR EXPANSION OF COMMERCIAL KITCHEN AREA (ANDIAMO): Located on the south side of Fourteen Mile Road, approximately 823.28 ft. west of Van Dyke Avenue; 7096 Fourteen Mile Road; Section 04; Joe Vicari/Vicari Realty (Robert A. Hoida/O-X Studio, Inc.). Minor amendment is for expansion of commissary kitchen area: PMA230010. **Postponed from December 4th, 2023.**

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Robinson to remove from being postponed, supported Assistant Secretary Chowdhury. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

PETITIONER PORTION:

Mr. Robert Hoida – Good evening Commissioners. Thank you for inviting me back. I’m embarrassed for not having all the information the last site plan, we’ve corrected all those things. I think the list of qualifications or conditions have been reduced significantly. We’ve

add zoning notes and dimensions that were required, we've added building setback dimensions. Also added and clarified some of the building and property dimensions as well. We've transferred the bearings and survey information from the survey to the property lines on the site so that they are now on the site plan. We've added labels for the flood zones and landscaped areas that were not on the plan before.

The one change I've made is we did indicate an open storage area which you'll notice on your site plan, that site plan is for open storage. That area currently has three storage containers on it, so their temporary storage containers that have probably been there for a long time, they are unconditioned spaces. They are literally shipping containers that they are using for storage. You'll see three dash boxes on your site plan indicating that area, so I don't know whether you consider those open storage or not but we've indicated that area for temporary open outdoor storage area.

As I mentioned before the building addition 21 ft. 6 in, x 130 ft 4 1/2 in. it mimics the existing building it's the same height as the existing building. It's a fairly simple addition I'm open for any questions. Thank you.

MOTION:

A motion was made by Secretary Mouri to recognize as a minor amendment, supported by Commissioner Ansar.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes

Secretary Mour reads the following correspondence:

TAXES: Current.

ENGINEERING: Preliminary review of this site indicates that Planning Commission Approval should be contingent upon the petitioner's compliance with the following conditions.

1. Provide complete and accurate legal descriptions of the individual parcels (1,2, & 3) including their parcel identification numbers prior to parcels combination.
2. Any construction in the flood plain/zone shall require a permit from EGLE.

FIRE: The Warren Fire Department approves this site plan.

MCPW: Please be advised that this letter is for comment in relation to right of way and county drain easements only. It appears there will be no work within or near a county drain or easement, therefore this office would have no objection to this request. Prior to site plan approval, any proposed project that is under the jurisdiction of this office shall schedule an engineering meeting with this office to discuss how our standards may apply. To schedule a meeting with this office please contact heather.morin@macombgov.org. Please contact this office, should you have any questions, 586-469-5910.

Mr. Ron Wuerth reads the recommendation of the Staff:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury to approve minor amendment, supported by Commissioner Ansar.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes

- B. **2ND MINOR AMENDMENT TO SITE PLAN FOR COMMERCIAL COMPONENT “C” (MEIJER STORE):** Located in the northwest corner of Twelve Mile and Mound Roads; 29505 Mound; Section 8; Michael Flickinger/Meijer, Inc. (Ryan Singles/Kimley-Horn of Michigan): PMA230011. The Minor Amendment is for the addition of EV charging stations and for a grass area due to the removal of parking spaces.

PETITIONERS PORTION:

Ms. Rachel Robinson – Good evening, I’m with Kimley-Horn and Engineering Planning and Consulting Firm, representing Meijer on this project. This facility was built in 2005. The store is over 200,000

square feet with over 1000 parking spaces, this is one of Meijer's larger stores. There was consideration in removing some of the parking spaces for less maintenance work required for paving purposes as well as adding beautification to the site. Meijer decided that they wanted to try and institute some greenspace conversation with some of the existing parking spaces as well as consolidate some EV spaces with some of the existing spaces on site. We still are over 1000 parking spaces, we are at 1006 versus the almost 1200 that we were, however, Meijer has done some research over the years and has noticed, especially in these larger stores, that they are very rarely at capacity of 1000 spaces. Eight hundred parking spaces is typically their standard and they are only seeing about ½ of that or a little more than a half of that at any given peak period being utilized.

That was the decision there and the history with why that was implemented as well as adding some EV charging stations for additional infrastructure use. I'd be happy to answer any questions.

Secretary Mouri reads the following correspondence:

TAXES: Current.

ENGINEERING: No Comments.

MCPW: Please be advised that this letter is for comment in relation to right of way and county drain easements only. It appears there will be no work within or near a county drain or easement, therefore this office would have no objection to this request. Prior to site plan approval, any proposed project that is under the jurisdiction of this office shall apply to the Macomb County Public Works Office Design Standards. It is advisable to schedule an engineering meeting with this office to discuss how our standards may apply. To schedule a meeting with this office please contact heather.morin@macombgov.org. Please contact this office should you have any questions 586-469-5910.

Mr. Ron Wuerth reads the recommendation of the Staff:

Item 2b – Just to let you know that in order to amend that PUD it would be between Grand Sawka and the City of Warren.

MOTION:

A motion was made by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury to approve the 2nd minor amendment, supported by Commissioner Ansar.

ROLL CALL:

Mary Clark CER-6819
December 18th, 2023

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Tutt to approve with the amendment to the site plan, supported by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.

COMMISSIONERS PORTION:

Secretary Mouri – How many EV charging stations are you planning on putting out there?

Ms. Rachel Robinson – Four.

Secretary Mouri – I know that’s the trend that we are going in especially with the new electrical cars coming out, on the other Meijer’s do you usually see a lot of the electric cars?

Ms. Rachel Robinson – That’s becoming very common with Meijer. I’m actually working with Meijer on their repaving program and that’s something that we’ve been trying to implement with each of the stores that come up each year. So yes it’s still very new, still not a lot of stalls that we put on each site it’s typically around four or five, but yes this is very common with what we’ve been doing at other stores.

Secretary Mouri – This is just kind of my thought I know you’re going through the whole process putting four or five out there with that becoming the trend and you guys have a lot of parking spaces as you’ve mentioned, what’s the reason you’re not putting more in?

Ms. Rachel Robinson – That’s definitely more of a Meijer consideration, but I think right now it is still new. It’s a large infrastructure investment to install these spaces just for the 4 I think it was around \$300,000.00, it’s still in the preliminary trial time. As EV become more and more popular Meijer is probably going to be on that train with putting in more stalls. Of course, as cities and municipalities come up with their own legislation around those

facilities that would of course be something that Meijer would abide by. With it being some guidelines now instead of standards we have been starting small.

Secretary Mouri – Thank you.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes

Secretary Mouri – I want to congratulate you because you are one of the first few that are putting EV charging stations in Warren.

Ms. Rachel Robinson – Thank you so much, great doing business with you guys.

- C. SITE PLAN FOR LANDSCAPING FACILITY WITH OPEN STORAGE: Located on the east side of Groesbeck Highway, approximately 756.81 ft. north of Frazho Road; 26190 Groesbeck Highway; Section 24; Robert Kluck (Zachary Matouka/The Yard Men): PSP230036. **Site plan approved November 6, 2023. Planning Commission approved performance bond of \$19,500.00 based on the estimated cost of \$650,000.00 provided by the petitioner at the time of application. Following site plan approval, the petitioner has submitted that the correct estimate cost is \$300,000.00 and is requesting a lower bond amount. Postponed from December 4th, 2023.**

PETITIONERS PORTION:

Mr. Zachary Matouka – So I made a mistake it was my first time going through all of this and I included the cost of the property on the estimated cost. So the \$300,000.00 dollars is what the site work at the building is going to cost that’s including electrical, plumbing, flatwork, concrete, and the actual cost of the building.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – In response to the petitioner’s request here we were expecting an estimate not just a guess. It’s not that I don’t believe the person, but we were waiting for the estimate that’s why this was postponed twice, and I don’t see one. I’d prefer not to

postpone this anymore I don't know what other proof this person could give us other than his word. I'm going to leave it up to the Planning Commission, but I wouldn't recommend it, I'd recommend what the bond initially was set for. Thank you.

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury – Is there any reason why the estimate was not submitted?

Mr. Zachary Matouka – No, I don't have full estimates for everything I just have my rough estimates, it is just an estimate. After looking through everything the \$650,000.00 dollars like I said it was the first time doing this, first time purchasing property it was literally just a shot in the dark and I didn't know that I had to do the bond so that's why I just put the higher number.

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury – But do you have an estimate in place like a quote?

Mr. Zachary Matouka – Yes, I don't have it on me, but I can supply it to the city.

Vice Chair Boniecki – When do you think you can have that estimate in by?

Mr. Zachary Matouka – Next meeting.

Chair Mouri – When was the last time you met with the Planning Director or team?

Mr. Zachary Matouka – I have not yet. I was at the variance meeting last week to get our variances approved so now we are moving forward with everything. Like I said I'm new to all this I'm just trying to figure everything out.

Vice Chair Boniecki – It would be postponed until January 22, 2024, would you be able to have the estimate in to them before that?

Mr. Zachary Matouka – Yes.

MOTION:

A motion was made by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury to postpone until January 22, 2024, supported by Secretary Mouri.

ROLL CALL:

Mary Clark CER-6819
December 18th, 2023

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes

9. BOND RELEASE:

SITE PLAN FOR OPEN STORAGE OF REPAIRED VEHICLES:
Located on the north side of Stephens Road between Groesbeck Highway and Schoenherr Road; 24111 Groesbeck; Section 25; Prior Associates, LLC (Jeffrey Prior). **Approved on February 25th, 2019. Completed, release the bond.**

MOTION:

A motion was made by Commissioner Tutt to release the bond, supported by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes

10. NEW BUSINESS:

Planning Commission Approval of the 2024-2025 Planning Department Budget:

Mr. Ron Wuerth – That you see before you at this time is corrections that were made from two weeks ago that were identified. The only other remaining thing that needs to be done is on page 22, where there is the reasoning for the Planning Commission members for an increase rate. At the bottom of the page it says an explanation so we need the explanation and what the reasons are to have that rate increased from the Planning Commission.

Secretary Mouri – I know when we talked about it last time Chair Warren was going to send an email and then it was also recommended by the City Attorney to discuss it. So the discussion was due to Warren being the 3rd largest city in the State of Michigan and going through all these approvals that we do in a year, I think those both were two of the reasons. So do you still want a formal email sent to you?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Are you speaking singularly or for the Planning Commission for the reason for the rate increase. Do other Planning Commissioners have something to add to that?

Secretary Mouri – I know we all agreed upon it, if anyone has any objections for the two reasons, I've provided please do mention it. I know that's what we discussed last time as a group too.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Okay we can take that right out of the minutes, that's no problem and we will put it into the document here.

Secretary Mouri – So we don't need to send a formal email?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – No, we can take it right from the minutes. Should you formally vote on that or not?

Ms. Mary Michaels – If there's a motion to approve the budget it could be with that change.

Commissioner Robinson – I realize that the planning staff office has been understaffed and I was going to make a suggestion and I thought about it prior to coming tonight. If Michelle was receptive to maybe increasing her salary I would say \$2600.00 dollars because she has been filling during your absence and doing a very good job of doing that. This is just a suggestion because I'm always thinking about cost containment and reducing budgets. If you increased her salary by \$2600.00 dollars and maybe adding another Assistant Planner to help with the work load paying the same amount of \$79,279.00 dollars you would still have an increase of \$81,879.00 versus having an Assistant Planning Director with a salary of \$102,646.00 that's still \$2000.00 less. Has consideration been mentioned of increasing her salary since she fills in when you're absent instead of just having another Assistant Planning Director at a salary of \$102,646.00 dollars? I'm just asking, has that ever been considered?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – No, it hasn't because these numbers of the wages are set through the Human Resources Department and agreed upon through the Controllers Office. I'm not sure what the process is to change them and do that type of thing. Also the Union would have to agree to that type of change.

Years ago, and we had the short conversation before the meeting, the reason for it was to pay the 2nd in command an amount that comes near but not all the way near what the Planning Director makes in pay. It was felt that it was fair then but you're suggesting a smaller amount and another position and another position with wage and health benefits built in it's a lot more than you think. Believe me I wouldn't mind another position, why not, but that's what it would take.

Commissioner Robinson – So what you're saying is that there are considerations beyond your control as to the set salaries is that what you're indicating?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – That's exactly what I'm saying. You're saying that Michelle as a Planner III would remain a Planner III but get a raise?

Commissioner Robinson – She would get an increase.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – That's a raise, that's an increase. And then not consider the Assistant Planner position at all, is that what you're say?

Commissioner Robinson – Well no, you're saying that your workload has increased since years past in which demands overtime so even if you hired another Assistant Planner it still falls short of paying an Assistant Planning Director \$102,646.00 dollars, it was just in my mind that type of consideration. She has been filling in when you are absent and still getting the same salary.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – That's the reason for changing this, it happened when I was a Planner III and the Planning Commission at that time choose to have a designed position Assistant Planning Director to take over when the Director is not there, that's what it's for. The city went along with it and the Union went along with it.

Commissioner Robinson – What year was that?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – I don't know the exact year it was over 20 years ago.

Commissioner Robinson – I just threw it out there, I was just looking at saving the \$20,000.00 dollars with what I suggested.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – This is part of the budget change I don't know what the Administration or City Council will say in regard to it. It's a reasonable thing otherwise she can get paid a differential every time I'm not there.

Commissioner Robinson – Because she hasn't been compensated for the extra duties that she had to assume when you were gone in the past, is that correct, she was getting her same salary, correct?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – I'm going to say most of the time somehow it seems like we paid her once or twice when I was gone, I'm not positive and I could be wrong. You have to understand that the responsibility is high, that's why someone has to pay someone more in order to take that position. So if I'm gone for two or three weeks then there's quite a bit of responsibility there that they have to take over and she would have to be responsible for. I guess you need to discuss this with the Planning Commission. We have to have this completed by I believe January 5th, 2024, is what the Mayor indicated. So if you want to take this back and discuss it amongst yourselves it would take a special meeting to come back for you to say yes we want to do it unless the Board agrees with exactly what you're saying.

Commissioner Tutt – I don't agree with that suggestion. It's not fair to Michelle at all to say give her \$2600.00 and not a position, that's not okay if anything give her the position and the pay.

Secretary Mouri – The rate that is listed is the highest amount you would get paid or is that the amount you start with?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – I believe it is, I don't believe there is any layer to it at all. If it's in and she is recommended for it then she'll get paid it.

Secretary Mouri – Currently there's a vacant position do you still have that Administrative Secretary position vacant?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – We have, the Administrative Secretary is vacant, the list of applicants has been approved, so that means we are going to move forward with I believe interviews.

Secretary Mouri – One of the reasons the department was filled with work is because they didn't have one for the whole year.

Vice Chair Boniecki – Are we ready to vote on the changes?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Look at page 21 and you'll see that Michelle's current rate is \$100,518.00 if it's traded actually the Planner III falls out we don't keep that, that's gone and it's replaced with the Assistant Planning Director at \$102,646.00 so it's kind of the same she's still over \$100,000.00 and gaining about \$2500.00 so that kind of takes care of what you're talking about Claudette. We wouldn't keep the Planner III position we would take that out.

Commissioner Robinson – That would be good if she applied for Assistant Planning Director then.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – We've got to get the position first, that's what we are asking for.

Commissioner Robinson – If she wants it.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – So you understand what's going on with the Administrative Secretary that's the person who really will run things in the front office. (inaudible) microphone turned off. And with only five applicants that means I would rather waive the examination like I have in the past with some of these other positions and interview all five, I can do that in a week that's not a big deal. These are all people from the outside so it's my choice.

Commissioner Ansar – As you said those raises are set who sets all of those wages the Planning Department or Human Resources.

Mr. Ron Wuerth – That would be Administration agreeing with that position being in the budget and removal of the Planner III position, replacing it basically and approval by City Council. The two would have to come and approve that and that being done then that position of Planner III stays until it's agreed that Michelle the promotion.

Commissioner Ansar – So Planning Department recommend and then City Council has to approve this?

Mr. Ron Wuerth – Yes this is what this is about. Michelle has moved up the ladder sort of speak and finally she’s gotten to this point and it’s time to get that changed.

Commissioner Ansar – Thank you.

Vice Chair Boniecki – We can put this to a vote with the change that the volume and time we spend on the items is the reason for the request for the increase for the Planning Commissioners.

MOTION:

A motion was made by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury to approve the budget with the changes, supported by Commissioner Tutt.

ROLL CALL:

The motion carried as follows:

Assistant Secretary Chowdhury.....	Yes
Commissioner Robinson.....	Yes
Commissioner Tutt.....	Yes
Commissioner Ansar.....	Yes
Secretary Mouri.....	Yes
Vice Chair Boniecki.....	Yes

11. CITIZEN PARTICIPATION:

None at this time.

12. PLANNING COMMISSION BUSINESS:

A) Planning Director’s Report:

Mr. Ron Wuerth – The Planning report is kind of thin, I’ve had a lot time off, like most of us have had here in the last month. I’ve attended the Fire Stations 1 and 5 that we approved and going over the issues on how to construct, they are under construction. As a matter of fact, this Thursday at 11:00 o’clock there will be the ground breaking ceremony on Van Dyke Avenue by Burnette Library somewhere in that area, they are going to have a ground breaking ceremony. That was reported to us by the Mayor. I’ve attended meeting in the last two weeks for that.

We finally approved Warren Estates the Cambio Project to move forward and that's our trailer park between Ten Mile and Frazho. Once it gets through the building division then they can start completing that site with additional manufactured housing.

Michelle and I attended a Zoom Meeting regarding the RFP's for the plans the non-motorized transportation plan and the green space conservation plan just discussing who were the best contestants to obtain the plans, we did that on the 11th. Had a Mayor's Meeting on the 12th. On the 13th I attended a Civil Service Meeting that's where a lot of things happened. I had approved a waiver of the exam of the Assistant Planner, when I say Assistant Planner that was those people who applied for the job who are considered external and non-employees. Which has nothing to do now with our new Assistant Planner who is here tonight.

There was an approval of the list of the Administrative Secretary and that Exterior Assistant Planner. There was the list of Shirley Taylor as our new Office Assistant, Amanda Mika our new Assistant Planner. This is Shirley and Amanda. If you come to the office, you can see them and get to know them. That is my report, if you have any questions.

B) Planning Commission Discussion and Concerns:

None at this time.

13. CALENDAR OF PENDING MATTERS:

None at this time.

14. ADJOURNMENT:

MOTION:

A motion was made by Assistant Secretary Chowdhury to adjourn, supported by Commissioner Robinson. A voice vote was taken and the motion carried unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:37 p.m.

Merle Boniecki, Vice Chair

Mahmuda Mouri, Secretary

Meeting recorded and transcribed by
Mary Clark - CER-6819

E-mail: maryclark130@gmail.com

Approved

Mary Clark CER-6819
December 18th, 2023